RESOLUTION NO. 2024-05

A RESOLUTION OF THE ARCHITECTURAL AND PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF CLAREMONT, CALIFORNIA, DENYING ARCHITECTURAL AND SITE PLAN REVIEW #22-A14, REVIEW OF PROPOSED 73-FOOT TALL STEEPLE TOWER TO SERVE AS A STEALTH WIRELESS TELECOMMUNICATIONS FACILITY FOR AT&T MOBILITY LOCATED AT 1700 NORTH TOWNE AVENUE - APPLICANT: EUKON GROUP, LLC ON BEHALF OF AT&T MOBILITY

WHEREAS, on September 26, 2022, the applicant filed a request for architectural and site plan and Special Use and Development Permit (SUDP) approval for the construction of a new church steeple tower that would serve as a concealed wireless telecommunications facility at the subject property, which is owned and used by a church; and

WHEREAS, new commercial wireless telecommunications facilities located on private property require the approval of a Special Use and Development Permit pursuant to Claremont Municipal Code (CMC) Section 16.100.040.C as well as architectural and site plan review approval pursuant to CMC Section 16.100.040.I; and

WHEREAS, on April 11, 2024, a notice of public hearing regarding the Architectural Commission review of the design of the proposed steeple tower/concealed wireless facility was mailed to surrounding property owners and residents in the 500-foot radius of the subject site; and

WHEREAS, the Architectural Commission held a public hearing on April 24, 2024, at which time all persons wishing to testify in connection with the revised proposal were heard and said proposal was fully studied; and

WHEREAS, on April 24, 2024, the Architectural Commission heard public comment, closed the public comment portion of the hearing, voted unanimously to direct staff to prepare a denial resolution for adoption at their next regularly scheduled meeting on May 15, 2024, finding that the project did not satisfy certain General Review Criteria in CMC Section 16.300.060; and

WHEREAS, on May 15, 2024, the Architectural and Preservation Commission held a duly noticed meeting to adopt the requested denial resolution.

NOW, THEREFORE, THE CLAREMONT ARCHITECTURAL AND PRESERVATION COMMISSION DOES HEREBY RESOLVE:

SECTION 1. The Architectural and Preservation Commission finds that the following review criteria of Section 16.300.060.A of the Claremont Municipal Code cannot be met regarding the above-described project as follows:

- 2. General Plan Consistency The proposed steeple tower and wireless telecommunications facility is inconsistent with the following goals/policies of the Claremont General Plan:
 - a. Protect neighborhoods from impacts from non-residential development (Policy 2-2.4); in that the project fails to adequately protect the surrounding residential

properties in terms of visual impacts from the large tower structure. The design of the proposed tower, which conceals the wireless equipment, is roughly three times the height of most structures in the vicinity of the project. This tower has an imposing presence that represents a detrimental impact to the surrounding residences that is impossible to mitigate, given the height of the tower structure and the lack of other tall structures or trees both on the subject property and on those that surround it.

- 3. Compatibility of Form with Surrounding Development The proposed tower and concealed wireless facility will visually dominate the established development pattern of the surrounding area and cannot be found compatible with existing development in terms of scale and height. While steeple towers are often found on church properties, the subject church property is characterized by low-lying existing structures, wide expanses of surface-level parking lots, and few tall, mature trees. The residential uses that surround the subject property are characterized by low-lying structures with a majority of the single-family residential homes being one-story in height. As such, the 73-foot tall tower stands out as inconsistent with surrounding development and cannot avoid unduly interfering with and visually dominating the surrounding urban context.
- 4. Compatibility of Quality with Surrounding Development The steeple tower and concealed wireless facility lacks an architectural character that is readily compatible with surrounding development, nor does it represent an enhancement to the surrounding suburban context. The design of the proposed tower takes cues from existing architecture on the site to achieve a desirable architectural form, but fails to do so, given the stark difference in form and height between the tower structure and the low-lying architecture on the subject property and those that surround it.
- 12. Health and Safety The imposing and out-of-scale appearance of the proposed tower would, if built, have a visual effect as viewed from adjacent public streets that is detrimental to the public interest, convenience, and welfare. While the proposed tower would screen the wireless telecommunications equipment from view, the tower itself has an imposing appearance inconsistent with the character of the neighborhood in which it is located resulting in the potential impacts to the public interest and the ability of the neighborhood's residents and visitors to enjoy its ambiance and suburban character.

SECTION 2. The Architectural and Preservation Commission Chair shall sign this resolution and the Commission's secretary shall attest to the adoption thereof.

PASSED, APPROVED, AND ADOPTED this 15th day of May, 2024.

Architectural and Preservation Commission Chair

ATTEST:

Architectural and Preservation Commission Secretary

STATE OF CALIFORNIA)
COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES)ss.
CITY OF CLAREMONT)

I, Melissa Sanabria, Administrative Assistant of the City of Claremont, County of Los Angeles, State of California, hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution No. 2024-05 was adopted by the Architectural and Preservation Commission of said City of Claremont at a regular meeting of said Commission held on May 15, 2024, by the following vote:

AYES:

Commissioners:

Bennett, Castillo, Neiuber, Perry,

Zimmerman

NOES:

Commissioners:

None

ABSTENSIONS:

Commissioners:

None

ABSENT:

Commissioners:

Cervera, Spivack

Administrative Assistant

City of Claremont