

RESOLUTION NO. 2025-

A RESOLUTION OF THE ARCHITECTURAL AND PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF CLAREMONT APPROVING ARCHITECTURAL AND SITE PLAN REVIEW #24-A08, REVIEW OF PROPOSED EXTERIOR REMODEL IN THE HISTORIC CLAREMONT DISTRICT OF AN EXISTING SINGLE-STORY RESIDENCE LOCATED AT 245 WEST ELEVENTH STREET. APPLICANT – LAURA CAYLEY

WHEREAS, on September 24, 2024, the applicant filed a request for a proposed exterior remodel, in a historic district to the existing 1,542-square foot home located at 245 West Eleventh Street; and

WHEREAS, the proposed remodel includes the addition of a small porch on the front of the house that extends three additional feet into the front setback and requires approval of a Minor Exception Permit (MEP) in order to allow the proposed encroachment; and

WHEREAS, the subject property is currently included in a list of addresses located along a three block section of West Eleventh Street contained in the Register of Structures of Historic or Architectural Merit in Claremont (“Claremont Register”); and

WHEREAS, because the proposed remodel involves significant changes to the front façade of a property currently listed on the Claremont Register, approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness by the Architectural and Preservation Commission is required; and

WHEREAS, on April 10, 2025, a notice of public hearing regarding the Architectural and Preservation Commission review of the design of the proposed remodel was mailed to surrounding property owners and residents in the vicinity of the subject site; and

WHEREAS, the Architectural and Preservation Commission held a public hearing on April 23, 2025, at which time all persons wishing to testify in connection with the revised proposal were heard and said proposal was fully studied.

NOW, THEREFORE, THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION DOES HEREBY RESOLVE:

SECTION 1. The Architectural and Preservation Commission has determined that the project, a porch addition and minor modifications to an existing home, which are designed in a manner intended to reinforce the historic character of the street on which it is located, is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) under section 15301(e). While the home is historic, having been built originally in 1908, and is listed on The Register of Structures of Historic and Architectural Merit of the City of Claremont, the exception pertaining to historic resources does not apply in this case as the proposed work would not result in a substantial adverse change to the historic nature of the residence as it has previously been heavily modified. The exterior renovation is designed to restore and enhance the architectural character of the structure and would

notably improve the ability of the structure to contribute to the historic character of the neighborhood. Therefore, no further environmental review is necessary.

SECTION 2. The Architectural and Preservation Commission finds that the review criteria of Section 16.300.060.A of the Claremont Municipal Code (CMC) can be met in regard to the above-described project as follows:

A. **Conformity with Development Standards** – The proposed renovation and porch addition is in conformity with all development standards for the HC 7,500 zoning district as follows:

- i. **Setbacks:** The proposed project will meet all setback requirements as follows:
 - a) **Front Setback:** The HC 7,500 district requires a 20-foot front setback. With the approval of the Minor Exception Permit (MEP) allowing for a 20% (four feet) reduction of the front setback the property will be in compliance with this development's standards. The home is currently setback 19 feet from the street, which is an existing, non-conforming setback. Approval of the requested MEP would allow for a 16-foot setback, which is similar to several other homes on this block.
 - b) **Side Setbacks:** The existing home maintains a legal nonconforming condition by which a small portion of the main residence, built in 1979, protrudes into the five-foot side setback and is located only 4 feet away from the front property line. However, no portion of the proposed renovation/porch addition protrudes into the existing required five-foot side setback area.
 - c) **Rear Setback:** The proposed project complies with the rear setback requirement of five feet.
- ii. **Lot Coverage:** The proposed lot coverage of 22.28 percent complies with the maximum permitted lot coverage of 35 percent in the HC 7,500 zoning district.
- iii. **Floor Area:** The proposed floor area of the primary residence is 1,542-square feet which is under the maximum permitted floor area of 3,125-square feet for the subject property. The newly proposed covered porch will add another 129-square feet of floor area for a new total of 1,671 square feet.
- iv. **Parking:** The existing detached 375-square foot garage will remain. The existing driveway will be maintained and may be used to provide off-street parking.
- v. **Building Height:** The proposed remodel does not include a proposal to increase the height of the structure. The existing height is well below the 25'-0" maximum height for single-family residential structures in the HC 7,500 zoning district.

B. General Plan Consistency - The proposed addition is consistent with the following goals/policies of the Claremont General Plan:

- i. Promote neighborhood identity and conservation of individual neighborhood character (Policy 2-1.3);* in that the proposed remodel builds upon and expands on the character of the individual structure located on the subject property and character of the historic neighborhood in which it is located. The proposed remodel is consistent with other single-story homes in terms of both design and size, employs high quality materials, and has an appearance that contributes to, rather than detracts from, the Eleventh Street streetscape. Furthermore, the project will remove low quality, incompatible modifications from the building, which include plywood siding over stucco, an awkwardly designed stoop and front room protrusion on the front façade of the building, and a variety of mismatched windows that have been installed in a piecemeal manner over time. In place of these modifications, the project will add a new front porch that includes period-appropriate Craftsman details that are designed to blend with the small scale and historic bungalows found along this portion of Eleventh Street.
- ii. Insist on excellence in architectural design of new construction in the city. (Policy 2-5.1);* in that the proposed remodel is creatively designed in a manner that includes the architectural style and materials of the Craftsman style of architecture and consists of quality materials such as local fieldstone foundations and column bases on the new front porch.
- iii. Promote community identity and local history by encouraging context-sensitive design and development, (Goal 2-11);* in that the proposed project would allow the existing 1908 residential structure to continue to convey its modest bungalow character while adding distinct Craftsman elements that enhance it architecturally and still provide the floor area and functionality desired by the applicant in a manner that complies with the development standards applicable to the property.

C. Compatibility of Form with Surrounding Development – The proposed exterior remodel will not unduly interfere, nor visually dominate the existing development pattern of the surrounding neighborhood, which features mostly single-family homes. In maintaining the height of the existing structure and introducing a porch roof on the front façade, the project effectively maintains the home's appearance as a one-story bungalow, in keeping with Eleventh Street's character. In light of the above, the proposed project would not have a visually imposing presence incompatible with the form of surrounding development.

D. Compatibility of Quality with Surrounding Development – The proposed project features a well-considered design that employs high-quality materials that not only reflect but also update and enhance the character of the existing residence. The project includes replacing the existing roof with new asphalt shingles, replacing old aluminum windows that no longer meet California Building Code requirements with new energy efficient windows, and repainting and re-

stuccoing the entirety of the home with a historically appropriate color palette. Design elements such as the extension of the main roof gable, the removal of existing plywood siding and replacement with a mix of stucco and clapboard siding, new vinyl windows with wood trim, and a stone-wrapped porch with wood posts and railing are consistent with the home's bungalow-craftsman style and are compatible with neighborhood's character. As such, it can be concluded the proposed project has a level of quality that is compatible with surrounding development in the HC 7,500 zoning district.

- E. **Internal Consistency of Design** – The proposed porch and exterior remodel will enhance the existing home in terms of materials, colors, design, and design details. The home will undergo a full reroof, repaint, re-stucco, and window-replacement across all facades. As such, the design of the project is consistent on all sides.
- F. **Privacy** – The proposed project will bring the building closer to the front property line. While the new porch will be closer to the southern, front property line, this will not impact existing privacy conditions from the adjacent neighbors and will serve to enhance the residence's relationship with the street.
- G. **Internal Circulation** - The redesign and extension of the porch and relocation of the front door will result in a floor and site plan that provides for adequate circulation throughout the home and around the property. The proposed project incorporates more opportunities for the interaction of the outdoor and indoor spaces of the home through the use of double-sided French doors and the front porch. Taken together, the features open up the space and bring in more natural light. The new porch and front door create a much more intuitive and inviting connection between the home and the street.
- H. **Sustainability** – The proposed remodel and associated landscaping will be energy and water efficient as it will be required to meet all applicable sustainability requirements and codes adopted by the City as well as the State's stringent green building code. The project is expected to improve the energy efficiency of the existing home, which was constructed prior to the establishment of energy codes. Additionally, by retaining and improving the existing structure, the proposal preserves the embodied energy of the existing structure and extends its useful life.
- I. **Tree Preservation** – There are several mature trees on the property, two of which would be removed with the construction of the project. The largest of which is located adjacent to the residence along the western façade. This tree, as demonstrated by the site photos seen in Attachment D, is causing significant concrete damage. Because this tree is located so close to the residence and its removal is necessary to preserve the integrity of the home's foundation, the tree is proposed to be removed. The second is located within the footprint of the proposed porch addition. Its removal is necessary for the execution of the proposed project. Neither tree is a significant tree species in the City of Claremont.
- J. Given that the proposal includes the removal of two trees necessary for the integrity and enhancement of the residence while preserving all other mature trees on site, staff finds that this review criterion is satisfied.

- K. **Light and Air** – The new front porch addition meets setbacks in conjunction with the approval of the minor exception permit allowing for a twenty percent reduction in the front setback and the proposed porch is constructed through the extension of the roof at its existing height which is well below the maximum height for the HC 7,500 zone. As such, these improvements are not expected to have the potential to impinge on the neighbor's access to light and air.
- L. **Cultural Resource Preservation** - The proposed development is in conformity with the requirements of the Claremont Cultural Resources Preservation Ordinance and has satisfied all applicable requirements of that code.
- M. **Health and Safety** - The visual effect of the development from view from adjacent public streets will not be detrimental to the public interest, health, safety, convenience, or welfare. It features a design that enhances the existing structure's relationship to the street and employs high-quality materials, meets all development standards in conjunction with the approval of the minor exception permit, and has been designed to embrace the character of the surrounding streetscape and historic district. As such, the development does not have the potential to be detrimental to the public interest, health, safety, convenience, or welfare.

SECTION 3. The Architectural and Preservation Commission finds that each of the review criteria of Section 16.302.160 of the Claremont Municipal Code (CMC) can be met in regard to the above-described project and hereby issues a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project. The most pertinent Criteria used in making this determination are as follows:

- A. The project will not create a significant adverse impact to the character-defining features, historic architectural character, or aesthetic interest or value by replicating and enhancing defining features and using materials to match the existing architecture while also creating a stronger more defined architectural style for the existing residence. The historic integrity of the home appears to have been lost over time due to poor maintenance and ill-advised modifications and this project acts to add period-appropriate character to the residence (CMC 16.302.160.A.4).
- B. The project will not adversely impact the qualities of the existing home including its relation to the street or public way and to other improvements and natural features, the texture, material, and color. In fact, the proposed project will noticeably enhance the existing home's relationship with the street and the new landscaping will act to serve the enhance architecture of the structure rather than envelop it. The project will use high-quality materials to enhance the core features of the existing home. The porch addition will be an extension of the existing framing of the residence and will allow it to maintain the historic one-story massing of the structure when viewed from the street and to maintain the rhythm of homes that are located along Eleventh Street in Historic Claremont (CMC 16.302.160.A.6).

- C. The proposed porch addition and exterior changes are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and associated guidelines as it is designed to enhance the historic nature, materials, design details, and massing of the existing home and replaces much of the degraded and historically detracting elements the existing home with appropriate, cohesive design elements in terms of materials, roof line and massing (CMC 16.302.160.B.1).

SECTION 4. The Architectural and Preservation Commission hereby approves Architectural and Site Plan Review #24-A08 based on the review criteria as outlined in Sections A and B above, subject to the following Conditions of Approval:

- A. This approval is for the site plan, floor plans, and elevations for an exterior remodel to an existing 1,542-square-foot single-story single-family residence located at 245 West Eleventh Street as depicted on the project plans.
- B. This approval is valid for two years from the date of Architectural and Preservation Commission action. If building permits are not issued, or a time extension has not been granted during this time frame, this approval shall automatically expire without further action by the City. The Community Development Director is authorized to grant a one-year extension upon written request from the applicants if there were unavoidable delays.
- C. Prior to the issuance of building permits, the applicants shall:
- i. Obtain approval of the requested Minor Exception Permit from City Planning Division Staff.
 - ii. Submit a landscape plan for any proposed changes to front and backyard landscaping. The landscape plan shall comply with the State's Model Water Efficient Landscaping Ordinance (MWELO).
 - iii. Work with City Staff to maintain, restore, or reuse the existing floor to ceiling multi-pane, true divided light wood windows on the front façade of the residence and the first four window banks from the street on the eastern façade.
 - iv. Work with City staff to resolve any and all unpermitted work on site related to the historic building, landscaping, fencing or gates, accessory structures, and any other relevant items. All necessary permits or improvements shall be obtained or resolved within one year of the approval of this Architectural and Site Plan Review.
 - v. Ascertain and comply with all requirements of the City's Building Division, including the submittal of complete architectural, electrical,

mechanical, and structural plans duly wet stamped and signed by a licensed architect or engineer.

- vi. Ascertain and comply with all requirements of the City's Building Division, including the submittal of complete architectural, electrical, mechanical, and structural plans duly wet stamped and signed by a licensed architect or engineer.
- vii. The construction documents submitted for plan check shall be in substantial conformance with the Architectural and Preservation Commission approval.
- viii. Ascertain and comply with the requirements of the Los Angeles County Fire Department.
- ix. Pay all applicable permit and development review fees as established by City ordinances and resolutions.
- x. Pay all outstanding development review fees associated with Architectural and Site Plan Review File #24-A8.
- xi. Pay all applicable development/impact fees in accordance with the latest fee schedule, in effect at the time of permit issuance. This section requires payment of development impact fees, including but not limited to:
 - a. Fire Facility fees
 - b. School Impact fees
 - c. Drainage fees
 - d. City Sewer Connection fees

D. Prior to the issuance of any clearing/ grubbing/ and/or grading permit, the applicants shall:

- i. Submit a grading/drainage plan. Such plan shall:
 - a. Delineate all proposed improvements, including but not limited to, flat work, new residence and garage, accessory structures, entry gates, and doors, walls, landscaping, etc.
 - b. Clearly identify public right-of-way existing improvements.
 - c. Delineate flow line/proposed drainage.

- d. Show any utility boxes found on the property. If relocation is required, the applicants shall make adequate arrangements with applicable utility companies.
 - e. Show existing and proposed sewer connections (backflow prevention device needed if upstream manhole is not lower than finished floors of all buildings).
 - f. Be in compliance with any applicable MS4 permit requirements subject to the review and approval of the City Engineer. The developer shall work with the City to ensure compliance with all applicable MS4 requirements.
- xii. Submit a compaction test for grading pad(s).
- xiii. Prepare and submit a soils report, which addresses the geology, stability of the site, and grading requirements. Following rough-grade completion, compaction tests shall be conducted within the pad areas and compaction test reports shall be submitted to the City.
- xiv. Be in compliance with all water, wastewater, and hydrological requirements. This includes, but is not limited to:
 - a. Maximize the percentage of pervious surfaces to allow percolation of storm water into the ground.
 - b. Minimize the quantity of storm water directed to impervious surfaces and the City's Municipal Separate Storm Water Sewer System (MS4).
 - c. Direct roof-runoff to landscaped areas.
 - d. Do not discharge site drainage through underground pipes or any other conveyance to the City's MS4.

E. During grading and construction operations, the applicants shall:

- a. Implement best available control measures (BACMs) to minimize nuisance levels of construction activity emissions such as dust, emissions, and off-site impacts. BACMs shall include, but are not limited to, the following:
 - i. Water all active construction areas at least twice daily.
 - ii. Cover all haul trucks or maintain at least two-feet of freeboard.

- iii. Pave or apply water four times daily to all unpaved parking or staging areas.
- iv. Sweep or wash any site access points within 30 minutes of any visible dirt deposition on any public roadway.
- v. Cover or water twice daily any on-site stockpiles of debris, dirt, or dusty material.
- vi. Suspend all operations on any unpaved surface if winds exceed 25 mph.
- vii. Hydro-seed or otherwise stabilize any cleared area which is to remain inactive for more than 96 hours after clearing is completed.
- viii. Require 90-day low-NOx tune-ups for off-road equipment.
- ix. Limit allowable idling to five minutes for trucks and heavy equipment.
- x. Encourage carpooling for construction workers.
- xi. Limit lane closures to off-peak travel periods.
- xii. Park construction vehicles off traveled roadways.
- xiii. Wet down or cover dirt hauled off-site.
- xiv. Wash or sweep access points daily.
- xv. Encourage receipt of material during non-peak traffic hours.
- xvi. Sandbag construction sites for erosion control.
- b. Ensure the following measures are observed during all construction-related activities for the project:
 - i. The hours of construction operation are limited to the hours from 7 am to 8 pm, Monday to Saturday. No construction activity is allowed on Sundays and Federal holidays.
 - ii. Staging areas shall be located away from any existing residences as determined by the Building Official.
 - iii. All construction equipment shall use properly operating mufflers.

F. Prior to the release of the grading deposit, the improvements authorized by the grading permit shall be completed to the satisfaction of the City Engineer.

- G. During the course of all on-site grading and construction activity, the applicants shall employ adequate dust control measures in accordance with the California Building Code, SCAQMD, and City requirements to minimize fugitive dust.
- H. The applicant shall notify staff when all outside lighting fixtures become fully functional in order to commence a 30-day illumination review by the City. If illumination levels, glare, or readability are found to be unacceptable, then the applicant will be directed to modify the light(s) as necessary to be within acceptable limitations.
- I. Noise sources associated with construction activities shall not exceed the noise levels as set forth in Section 16.154.020(f) of the Claremont Municipal Code.
- J. Noncompliance with any condition of this approval shall constitute a violation of the City's Municipal Code. Violations may be enforced in accordance with the provisions of the administrative fines program of Chapter 1.14 of the Claremont Municipal Code.
- K. The applicants/owners, by utilizing the benefits of this approval, shall thereby agree to defend at its sole expense any action against the City, its agents, officers, and employees because of the issues of such approval. In addition, the applicants/owners shall reimburse the City et al for any court costs and attorney fees that the City et al may be required to pay as a result of such action. The City may, at its sole discretion, participate at its own expense in the defense of any such action, but such participation shall not relieve the applicants/owners of its obligation hereunder.
- L. Failure to comply with any of the conditions, including design issues as shown on plans reviewed and approved by the City of Claremont, may result in failure to obtain a building final and/or a Certificate of Occupancy until full compliance is reached. The City's requirement for full compliance may require minor corrections and/or complete demolition of a non-compliant improvement, regardless of costs incurred, where the project does not comply with design requirements and approvals that the applicants agreed to when permits were pulled to construct the project.

SECTION 5. The Architectural and Preservation Commission Chair shall sign this Resolution and the Commission's secretary shall attest to the adoption thereof.

PASSED, APPROVED, and ADPOTED this 23rd day of April, 2025.

Architectural and Preservation Commission Chair

ATTEST:

Architectural and Preservation Commission Secretary